Mediterranean Forest Research Agenda 2030 Webinar series – 3 November 2022

Forest management addressing trade-offs and synergies between multiple ecosystem services

Davide Travaglini

University of Florence

INTRODUCTION

The demand for ES is growing, but how to manage ecosystems for multiple services is still an open question

ES are not independent of each other and the relationships between them may be highly non-linear

Attempts to optimize a single service often lead to reductions or losses of other services \rightarrow "traded-off"

Forests continue to be managed through conventional means with single or few objectives \rightarrow unable to address the current challenges

Maximizing production of a service (or set of services) may lead to a less resilient and more vulnerable system, not only from the ecological but also from a socio-economic perspective

Mediterranean forests

Part of a landscape mosaic that reflects interactions between variable climatic and geomorphological conditions, regional landforms and human influence

Multiple goods and benefits, which are crucial for the socioeconomic development of rural areas, as well as for the wellbeing of the urban populations

Silviculture and forest planning approaches, with few exceptions, have been mostly wood based

The ability to provide multiple ES will be increasingly affected by environmental and social changes





2010-2020 Mediterranean Forest Research Agenda – key challenges

a) Develop tools and methods to predict the effects of forest management on ES and related resources

b) Design new forest management models that address the multifunctionality in an integrated stand-tolandscape scale

c) Develop user-friendly forest landscape DSS to capture the preferences of key stakeholders, and be able to optimize forest management to ensure the provision of ES



OBJECTIVES

We reviewed the scientific literature specifically dealing with forest management and multiple ES in Mediterranean forests, with the aim of:

- 1) Outlining the progress in research in the last 10 years
- 2) Identifying knowledge gaps and research needs

3) Discuss management approaches considering multiple ES

Current Forestry Reports (2022) 8:229–256 https://doi.org/10.1007/s40725-022-00167-w

FOREST MANAGEMENT (M WATT, SECTION EDITOR)

Check to

Managing Mediterranean Forests for Multiple Ecosystem Services: Research Progress and Knowledge Gaps

Susanna Nocentini¹ · Davide Travaglini¹ · Bart Muys²

Accepted: 21 March 2022 / Published online: 7 April 2022 © The Author(s) 2022

Abstract

Purpose of Review Forests provide multiple ecosystem services (ES) to society, and the demand for ES is growing at the global level. However, how to manage forests for the provision of multiple and sometimes conflicting services is a complex and still unresolved issue. In this study, we reviewed the scientific literature for the period 2010-2020 dealing with forest management and multiple ES in Mediterranean forests, with the aim of (1) outlining the progress in research, (2) identifying knowledge gaps and research needs, and (3) discussing management approaches considering multiple ES. The selected literature was analyzed considering different aspects of multiple ES (e.g., drivers of changes, modeling approaches, tradeoffs, and synergies).

Recent Findings Our results show that wood production is still one of the main management objectives, with an increasing attention toward non wood forest products. Carbon sequestration and biodiversity were the most investigated regulating functions, but also specific aspects are gaining attention (e.g., lichens for microclimate regulation). Changes in stand structure and density, the impact of coppice vs. high forest, and the effect of management practices vs. abandonment were considered as drivers of change at the stand/management unit scale, while the impact of climate changes and disturbances were considered at the landscape/regional scale using modeling.

Summary Despite the progress made in the last decade, our review highlights that further research is needed to fill the gaps in the scientific literature regarding how forest management influences the provision of multiple ES in the Mediterranean region. From a conceptual point of view, there is the need for a shift to a new paradigm based on an adaptable, flexible management, and planning approach to sustain self-organization, adaptive capacity, and overall resilience of Mediterranean forests, overcoming the ecosystem "servico" approach; operatively, research should move toward a transdiscipilinary approach, which considers problems from a diversity of points of view and involves extended peer communities not only in the dissemination of research results, but also in the research process itself.

Keywords Forest functions - MFRA - Multi-functional forests - Multi-objective forest management - Multifunctionality -Trade-offs - Synergies

This article is part of the	Topical Collection on Forest
Management	

Introduction

Davide Travaglini davide.travaglini@unifi.it Susanna.Nocentini susanna.nocentini@unifi.it

> Bart Muys bart.muys@kuleuven.be

- ¹ Department of Agriculture, Food, Environment and Forestry, University of Florence, San Bonaventura 13, 50145 Florence, Italy
- ² Division of Forest, Nature and Landscape, KU Leuven, Celestijnenlaan 200E box 2411, 3001 Leuven, Belgium

The current demand for multiple goods and benefits from forests, collectively termed "ecosystem services" (ES) [1], is growing rapidly at the global level, but uncertainty remains as to how to manage ecosystems for the provision of multiple, and sometimes conflicting, services [2]. According to Manning et al. [3•], multifunctionality has been defined only broadly as "the simultaneous provision of multiple functions" [4] and "the potential of landscapes to supply multiple benefits to society" [5], but underlying these seemingly simple definitions are complex and unresolved issues regarding the conceptualization and

MATERIALS AND METHODS

- Scopus and WoS databases (period 2010–2020)
- Criteria used to select documents:
 - 1. The research must be related to forests in the Mediterranean basin
 - 2. The research must be related to the forest management context
 - 3. At least one ES and the relationships with forest management must be considered

Snowball approach (final set of 56 documents):

- Scale/scope of research
- Considered ES and indicators
- Drivers of change in ES provisioning
- Modeling approaches
- Forest types
- Interactions between ES and trade-offs and synergies

	Posisian Annual Protein	pix continu			Subscruting for	Charlingrang Kith (2014) 725-741		
EL SEVIER	Corner ten withits a Ecosystem Se journal torroppy — a check	staatbas rvices e contoneroose			Conversion Science of th	n notek et Sensitiver ne Total Environment na ateavlet conflicted atean	(C)	
Future trade-offs an forests under globa Alejandra Moria-Ordédis Farrigio La forest, "Las f Tempo de La forest de la constance internet de la constance de la constance de la constance de la constance de la constance de la	nd synergies among ecosystem 1 change scenarios at ", Aior Amorigu", Agu 1006 - May Barris, Alar 8 de Status, Alar Status, Alar 8 de Status, Alar Status, Alar 8 de Status, Alar Status, Alar 1006 - Status, Status, Alar 1007 - Status, Status, Alar 1007 - Status, Status, Alar 1007 - Status, Status, Status, Alar 1007 - Status, Status	m services in Mediter	tinean State bland Tarens has sud Facebogical period harmange, www.	Hydrology-orie framework.com Alberts Carda Bran etc.com Balant Albert Carda Bran Albert Carda Bran Hindicators above cardinant watched	nted forest managemer pling field data, simulati * Marta Consilier. Societ: A	nt trade-offs. A modeling on results and Bayesian Network molo D. Del Campo, Cristita Lid delatata hara stato titta Lina Lina statata hara stato titta Lina Lina statata dela stato titta Lina Lina stato delatata della Lina Lina stato della stato della stato stato della stato della stato della stato stato della stato della stato della stato stato della stato della stato stato della stato della stato della stato della stato stato della stato della stato della stato della stato della stato stato della stato della stato della stato della stato della stato della stato stato della stato della stato della stato della stato della stato della stato stato della stato della stato della stato della stato della stato stato della stato		
Announce of the second	Welcherzmann fannte parp a knyr galten röfuger. Wy consend flas fri er fanger fange fan en fange fan en fange meget a fan en fange af en fange fan er en fange fan en fange af en fange er en fange fan en fange fan en fange fange fan en fange fan en fange fange en de oarte artemanie fan en fange fange en de oarte artemanie fan en fange fange en de oarte artemanie fan en fange hennen en de oarte artemanie fan en fange hennen en de oarte artemanie fan en fange hennen en en fange en fange en fange hennen en fange en fange en fange en fange hennen en fange en fange en fange en fange hennen en fange en	original Articles Assessing the distr Mediterranean reg Jose V. Baces Dist ^{alor} , Jose A. Banet ^{1,1} , Luis Jaam Martinez de Arag ¹ (2024) Internetiones de Arag ¹	Ibution of forest ecosyste ion Jord Vayreda", Mireta Banqué Storosa" ²⁴ , Migael De Cheres ¹ ⁴⁶ , Sergio de Mittaud ⁴ , Jord M ⁴⁶ stilla catalan basi ⁴⁶ stilla catalan basis	m services in a highly Gisanovis", Marci Cust ⁹ , M ¹ , Sengi Hernanch ¹⁶ , arthrez-Vilalte ^{2,4}	populated are Anton",	The second secon	very for adaptation due for the coupy watch age for high generated for interact program age for our restored to a set for of vettor and count or with different o	
Introduction The consists, from it is its Multi-interacts had here exercised is stars with doing will intractional associate by providing analysis workers where the Unit for the star that exercise that it is the final stated goals and an effort, stated associated in it. Brits from the stated goals and an effort, stated associated in it. Brits for the stated stated is the state of the state of the foregoing in the state of the state of the state of the states and the state of the state of the state of the states and the state of the state of the state of the states and the state of the state of the state of the states and the state of the state of the state of the states and the state of the state of the state of the state of the states of the state of the state of the state of the states of the state of the state of the state of the state of the states of the state of the state of the state of the states of the states of the state of the state of the state of the states of the state of the state of the state of the state of the states of the states of the state of the state of the state of the states of the states of the state of the state of the states of the states of the states of the state of the state of the state of the states of the states of the state of the state of the states of the s		¹ Department () (Fig. and Horse Association () Except Spectra and Association () () Except Spectra and Association () () () () () () () () () () () () () () (and high to produce a strategy can be a strategy of the strate			which is the processing of the Construction		
processing in the sector of the sector sector sector sector (France) processing in the Northern sector of the Medicinanual Science (Control of the Sector			yinal load over internation (when all deformation) and deformation of this analysis with a second second second disc available with a second second second the based of the second second second the based of the second second second second parative restrict second school parative restrict second second parative restrict second second parative restrict second seco	a. At 63 Statisticano were appropriated as receiver, We can solve approximation of the observation occurrence, planners and back-ready world approximate approximation of the observation of the planners of the observation of the observatio	the markinghilly level as a bolt, we will as bolt, re- source more that the well as bolt, re- don many contains analysis on the second second large of more second second second second large of more second second second second large of more second second second second protected associated with perguination of posterior associated with perguination of posterior associated with perguination of a second second second second second posterior associated associated with perguination of a second	L translation One important dijector of adaptive from the distance-offend of almost disk of a distan- tering two and match and almost a given in productively, reducing forest free side, ender productively, reducing forest free side, ender	nangement in to rela Otroposit in al. 201 upper, exclusioning e ong soil leater contr ong soil leater contr	
		 Introduction Toront supported air key Indexessity (Intrust et al., 10 Insolute air provide multiple under (IMI), 2005). Some ai regulating services: chance ai "intropositig column: (2004). 	daments for the maintenance of global by Tray mappet a maps of secontain and samel di coverant arrive (ED) to the main former 15 can be takedided an di meter regulatione, minime and their interest constants of the state. 2010/01 Con-	control, etc. Offeren et al., 2003), where out extranal review are a former comparison have been any binners are of the fundatorape, all forferener and the current could furtherappenduct to space (Fel. 2015). Securit automs have fuglights make and (etc), however, typic.	Herwisz, natariala and energy pri- ity of event to forests 00745, 3096, and constrained workfull by the larger the remeatry of Factorica dis- tion of from energy of Factorica Highly 4, Numbers at 21, 2013, and the offersance of the Medicentry of the Advances of the Medicentry			
		Event addresses proceedings of an intervention of the standard pro- ference of a standard 20 in the strend frequency of a standard 20 in the strend frequency of a standard 20 in the strend standard 20 in the standard 20 in	n, (remaining an all (AV Remaining) Defaulty a second lines 20 May 2016, howards 27 May 20 (

RESULTS

Growing research interest towards the impact of forest management on the provision of multiple ES

- Research papers: 82% of the selected documents
- Literature reviews and general discussions: 18% of the selected documents
- Papers from northwestern countries: 91% of the selected documents
- Papers from south and south-eastern countries: 9% of the selected documents

Scale of application

Stand / management unit level (32% of the selected documents):

- Experimental field data •
- Inventory data •
- Retrospective studies based on archives •

Landscape / Regional scale (43% of the selected documents):

- Stakeholder perception •
- **Expert** opinion •
- Modeling •







1.8 2.7

Ecosystem Services

Most of the publications mentioned one, two, or three ES (77%) Rarely more than three ES have been considered (23%) Twenty different ES were considered

P – Provisioning (8 ES)

- Wood production
- Increasing attention on NWFP

New terms have been coined (e.g., mycosilviculture, hydrology-oriented silviculture)

R – Regulating (8 ES)

- Climate regulation and biodiversity
- Increasing attention on specific aspects (e.g., lichen communities for microclimate regulation)

C – Cultural (4 ES)

Less investigated



Indicators

ES		Indicator	Unit		
	Cork	Cork supply	kg		
			kg ha⁻¹		
		Annual increment cork mass	kg ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹		
	Edible mushroom	Mushroom production in one year	kg ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹		
		Mushroom production	kg ha⁻¹		
	Fodder	Annual fodder production	Annual FU		
		Forage for goats and forage for cattle	kcal m ⁻²		
		Grazing	FU		
	Genetic resources	Seed dispersal	ha		
	Honey	Annual honey production	kg ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹		
PROVISIONING		Index based on flower counts in the plots	Score (0-10)		
	Pine nut	Annual cone production	kg ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹		
			kg tree ⁻¹ year ⁻¹		
	Water	Deep drainage into the water table	l m ⁻² yr ⁻¹		
		Annual water	m ³ ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹		
		Water recharge	mm yr ⁻¹		
		Water quality based on nitrate yield	kg ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹		
	Wood	Wood production per year	t ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹		
			m ³ ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹		
		Wood production	m ³ ha ⁻¹		
			t ha-1		
		Capacity to fulfil different functions	Score (0-10)		
		Timber yield	m ³		
		Annual increment	m³ ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹		

	Indicator	Unit
Biodiversity	Grassland habitat cover	%
	Tree microhabitats	n ha ⁻¹
	Habitat for biodiversity (deadwood)	m³ ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹
	Habitat conservation	Score (0-10)
	Density of geophyte, density of flowers	n m ⁻²
	Density of fleshy fruits	kcal m ⁻²
	Tree species diversity	-
		Ν
	Floristic diversity	-
	Reptiles	Ν
	Reptile (species richness)	Ν
	Bird (species richness)	Ν
	Bird species (density)	n ha ⁻¹
	Vertebrate (species distribution)	На
	Photosynth. perform. by macrolichens	-
	Stand structure diversity indices	-
	Ecosystem diversity (pattern analysis)	-
Climate regulation	C in above ground biomass	Kg
		kg ha⁻¹
		Mg ha ⁻¹
		t_{CO2eq}
	C in above and below ground biomass	t ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹
		kg ha⁻¹
	C in above ground and below ground biomass,	Mg ha ⁻¹
	C in above and below ground biomass from annual increment of tree volume	t _{CO2eq} ha ⁻¹ yr ⁻¹
	Gross primary production and soil respiration	kg C·m ⁻² ·year ⁻¹
	Vegetation C and soil organic C	kg C·m⁻²

ES

REGULATING

(the full list is available in the review)

Drivers of Change

The majority of the studies considered forest management as the only driver of change (72%)

The remaining studies considered no more than three drivers

Forest management was combined with climate change (20%) and to a lesser extent with fire (4%)

Few studies (4%) combined climate change and biodiversity with management or socio-economic variables

Stand / management unit scale

- Stand structure and density
- Coppice vs. high forest
- Traditional management vs abandonment

Landscape/ regional scale

Impact of climate and disturbances such as fire



Modeling Approaches

Model name	l name Country Scenario Scale Time period map (years)		Forest type	Ecosystem services		Drivers of change	Trade-offs and synergies			
						Provisioning	Regulating	Cultural		
GOTILWA	Spain	No	MU	200	Pine, Evergreen oak	Wood production	Climate regulation Water use efficiency	Fire risk	Forest management Climate Change Soil	Trade-offs analysis
PICUS	Spain	No	L	120	Pine	Cone production Wood production	Climate regulation	n.c.	Forest management Climate change	No
SUBER	Portugal	No	L	90	Oak	Cork production Climate regulation n.c.		Forest management Climate Change	No	
SADFLOR	Portugal	No	R	50	Oak	Cork production Wood production	Climate regulation	n.c.	Forest management	Trade-offs analysis
SORTIE-ND	Spain	No	L	99	Pine	Wood production Edible mushrooms production Water provisioning	Biodiversity Climate regulation Erosion control	n.c.	Forest management Climate change	Trade-offs and synergies analysis
LURE	France	Yes	L	200	Silver fir	Genetic resources	Biodiversity	n.c.	Forest management	No
-	Portugal	Yes	Ν	40	Different forest types	Water provisioning (water quality)	Erosion control	n.c.	Forest management	No
MIMOSE	Italy	Yes	R	20	Different forest types	Wood production	Climate regulation	n.c.	Forest management	Trade-offs analysis
TOOFES	Italy	Yes	MU	50-210	Silver fir	Wood production	Biodiversity Climate regulation	Recreational use	Forest management	Trade-offs analysis
-	Italy	Yes	MU	n.c.	Oak	Cork production Fodder production Water provisioning	Climate regulation	n.c.	Forest management	No
-	Spain	Yes	R	Different time period depending on ESs	Different forest types	Edible mushrooms production Water provisioning Wood production	Climate regulation Erosion control Flood protection Soil fertility Water regulation	Experiential use Landscape conservation Physical use Recreational use	Socioeconomic variables Climatic variables Biodiversity variables	Trade-offs and synergies analysis
EEFMD	Spain	Yes	R	90	Oak Pine	Water provisioning	Climate regulation	n.c.	Forest management Land abandonment	Trade-offs analysis
-	Tunisia	Yes	L	n.c.	Oak	Cork production Fodder production	Climate regulation Erosion control	n.c.	Forest management	No

(the full list is available in the review)

Forest Types

Cork oak woodlands (20% of the selected documents)

Pine stands (29% of the documents)

Oak forests (11% of the documents)

Broadleaved and coniferous forests (32% of the documents)





DISCUSSION

What have we learned from research in the last ten years?

Process-oriented research based on field experiments and research protocols is still at the beginning

Research based on spatially explicit data and modeling is showing substantial progress \rightarrow growing ability in data processing and increasing availability of remote sensing data

Approaches based on one or few ES

- More flexibility in accounting for drivers of change
- Only partial view of the multifunctional role of forest ecosystems

Approaches based on a wide range of ES

- Rely on heterogeneous data
- Data combination more complex and less robust
- Uncertainty assessment

Selection of ES indicators is frequently problematic

- Some indicators are not considered because of the lack of information
- Some indicators used to assess a specific ES could be related with more than one ES
- Information regarding marketed services of forest ecosystems is still scarce



Forest management is one of the major drivers of change in multiple ES provision

- Spatial models provide ES maps that have many potential uses for decision-makers and planners
- Modeling complex forest dynamics is still a challenge for future research

Climate change is a growing global threat impacting on ES and human well-being

• A limited number of studies considered climate change as a driver in multiple ES provision

The impact of land abandonment on ES supply is still not fully understood

• The added effects of climate change and land abandonment can increase the risk of fire

Biodiversity loss is one of the biggest threats to Mediterranean ecosystems and their ES provision

- Clever forest management techniques in synergy with water, fire, livestock, bioeconomy management
- Lack of taxonomic expertise and monitoring efforts
- Citizen science

Synergy Trade-off

References in brackets () = one ecosystem service is not directly investigated as such but appears in the discussion/conclusions. References in blue = modelling approaches, in black = field data and experimental trials, in red = literature reviews. Drivers: * thinning intensity/type/stand density; ** regeneration method; *** evenaged/uneven aged; + traditional management; + + traditional management vs abandonment; + + + coppice/high forest; °long rotations

ES Syn 🔶	Wood	Cork	Pine nuts	Edible	Honey	Fresh water	Fodder	Carbon	Biodiversity	Water holding	Provisioning	Cultural	Regulating
Trad	production	production		mushrooms		(Blue water)		sequestration		capacity	services	services	services
₩uu 🕈											generic	generic	generic
Wood	-			([63])*				[69]*	[69]* [71]** ***				
production				[00]+					[71]				
Cork	[77]*	-						[68]*	[25]+				
production													
Pine nuts	[75]		-					[75]					
										[00]			
Edible				-						[82]			
mushrooms													
Honey	[81]°				-								
Fresh water		[68]*				-							
(Blue water)													
Fodder		[68]*					-						
Carbon	[75]	[25]++				[83]++		-	[69]*				
sequestration	[76]+++ [77]* [87]*** +++								[86]* +++ [88]+				
Biodiversity									-	[84]°			
Water holding										-			
capacity													
Provisioning											-	[82]	
services													
generic													
Cultural											[82]	-	
services													
generic													
Regulating											[82]		-
services													
generic													

How should we manage Mediterranean forests for the provisions of multiple ES?

"Think globally, act locally"

Global level

- Forest resilience and adaptive capacity in face of an uncertain future both in the environmental and socio-economic condition
- Consider stakeholder perceptions and expectations as drivers



Local level

- Two main constraints: water limitation and fire risk (climate change and land use changes)
- Need for forest management approaches that can promote
 - Synergy between fire prevention and water management both at the stand and landscape scale, especially where land abandonment is favouring a densification of forest stands
 - Synergies with biodiversity conservation and circular bioeconomy

Overall, management should increase heterogeneity and adaptability of simplified and often maladapted forest systems in the face of changing conditions



Thinning

- Potentially beneficial in terms of reducing the risk of fire hazard
- Increasing the ground water supply

But may as well lead to a certain loss of forest microclimate

- ✓ Optimal density for these combined benefits depends on the site, composition, and structure of each specific situation
- ✓ Research must focus on more in-depth knowledge of the ecohydrology of Mediterranean forests and their response to drought to ensure the best application of these management practices



CONCLUSIONS

Research is still mostly conceived following an ES-oriented approach

- Managing forests to create the structure and composition that best meet the desired output for humans
- Reduced ability of forest ecosystems to adapt to future unexpected changes

Consider Mediterranean forests as complex adaptive systems

- This implies an adaptable, flexible management and planning approach that sustains self-organization, adaptive capacity, and overall resilience of Mediterranean forests
- Promote functionally diverse forests and landscapes, which can act as insurance for the maintenance of key ecosystem functions such as, e.g., water conservation and regulation, carbon storage, resilience against disturbances (fire, drought), and ecosystem productivity



- Maintain traditional Mediterranean forest landscapes, not only for their cultural and historical importance, but also because they can contribute to keeping more options open for adaptation to future changes
- Human presence and involvement in Mediterranean forest landscapes is a safeguard against the negative consequences of rural abandonment
- Both research and policymakers should contribute to finding sustainable solutions for maintaining economically and environmentally viable livelihoods in these environments
- Research on managing Mediterranean forests for multiple functions and benefits requires moving toward a transdisciplinary approach, where extended peer communities are involved



Mediterranean Forest Research Agenda 2030 Webinar series – 3 November 2022

Forest management addressing trade-offs and synergies between multiple ecosystem services

